## Preparing for the review of the EU ETS The plan to decarbonise industry while protecting against the risk of carbon leakage

10 March 2021

Andrei Marcu, ERCST Jean-Yves Caneill, ERCST Domien Vangenechten, ERCST



Roundtable on Climate Change and Sustainable Transition

# **ERCST – revision of EU ETS work**



Roundtable on Climate Change and Sustainable Transition

- Accompany the Commission's process: stakeholder meetings on a regular basis and provide inputs for the debate through (position) papers
- Organise activities on some of the core topics/issues that are important in light of the ETS revision:
  - 29 September 2020 <u>the EU ETS in the Commission's 2030 climate target plan</u>
  - 23 November 2020 <u>Stakeholder views on the Commission's Inception Impact Assessment</u>
  - 16 December 2020 <u>Dealing with supply-demand imbalance, including the review of the</u> <u>Market Stability Reserve</u>
  - 21 January 2021 division and use of auctioning revenues + reflecting on the December EUCO decisions
  - 28 January 2021 Public consultation for the review of the EU ETS

#### ERCST

#### **ERCST – revision of EU ETS work**

Roundtable on Climate Change and Sustainable Transition

#### **Recent papers and policy contributions:**

- June 2020 <u>The EU ETS Market Stability Reserve: Coping with COVID-19 and preparing for</u> <u>the review</u>
- November 2020 <u>the role of the EU ETS funding mechanisms in financing the European</u> Green Deal
- November 2020 Feedback to the Commission's Inception Impact Assessment
- February 2021 ERCST's response to the Commission's public consultation
- February 2021 <u>Division and use of revenues in Phase 4 of the EU ETS options to</u> operationalise the December 2020 EUCO conclusions
- February 2021 Addressing the supply-demand imbalance in the EU ETS through the Market Stability Reserve



Roundtable on Climate Change and Sustainable Transition

### Background

#### **European Green Deal**

- "Achieving a climate neutral and circular economy requires the full mobilisation of industry. It takes 25 years a generation to transform an industrial sector and all the value chains. To be ready in 2050, decisions and actions need to be taken in the next five years."
- "EU industry needs 'climate and resource frontrunners' to **develop the first commercial applications of breakthrough technologies** in key industrial sectors by 2030."

#### 2020 Industrial Strategy

- "The European Green Deal is Europe's **new growth strategy**. At the heart of it is the goal of becoming the world's first climate-neutral continent by 2050."
- "All relevant players should work together to **create lead markets in clean technologies** and ensure our industry is a global frontrunner."

### **Industrial decarbonisation: track record**



Roundtable on Climate Change and Sustainable Transition

Industry has reduced its emissions by over 30% since 1990, and over 20% since 2004. However, emissions have mostly stagnated since 2013 (at least until 2018)



Index of emissions for selected industrial sectors

Average yearly emissions reductions since 2013: Power: - 5.6% // Industrial heat: -2.5% // Industry: -0.4%

Source: 2020 State of the EU ETS Report

### **Industry in the 2030 Climate Target Plan**



Roundtable on Climate Change and Sustainable Transition



*Source*: Commission impact assessment accompanying the 2030 climate target plan communication <sup>C</sup>

### **Industry in the 2030 Climate Target Plan**



Roundtable on Climate Change and Sustainable Transition

- According to the impact assessment, the necessary reductions by 2030 can be achieved through further adopting more energy efficient processes, and through fuel switching (from fossil fuels to electricity/biomass)
- However, this would not put industry on the right trajectory towards 2050

Figure 65:  $CO_2$  emissions in industry by sector and type (sectoral emissions refer to energy-related emissions)



*Source*: Commission impact assessment accompanying the 2030 climate target plan communication

# **Industry: preparing for 2050**

#### ERCST

Roundtable on Climate Change and Sustainable Transition

- To prepare for 2050 and ensure the uptake of breakthrough low-carbon technologies after 2030, the economic and technical feasibility of these technologies has to be proven at scale in the coming years.
- While the carbon price plays an important factor, it will not reach the levels necessary to do this in the coming decade.



Source: AgoraEnergiewende, 2021 (Based on Agora Energiewende / Wuppertal Institute, 2019) // EUA price range: BNEF, 2021

# **Industry: preparing for 2050**

ERCST

Roundtable on Climate Change and Sustainable Transition

- Not only the carbon price level, but also its uncertainty impacts investment decisions
- Other crucial elements include: mobilizing necessary investments; availability of clean energy; energy prices; uptake of low-carbon products, etc.
- What will be the policy toolbox to help start deploying these low-carbon technologies in the coming decade? Both 'pull' and 'push' policies necessary, and many being discussed:
  - EU ETS Innovation Fund;
  - Carbon Contracts for Difference;
  - Consumption Charge;
  - Labels and standards;
  - Public procurement;
  - Infrastructure;
  - Etc.

What should be part of this *policy toolbox* for industry in the coming decade(s), and how does the EU ETS fit in?

#### ERCST

# The future of carbon leakage protection

- Roundtable on Climate Change and Sustainable Transition
- As long as climate change policies continue to be asymmetrical, the risk of carbon leakage will
  persist.
- So far, this risk has been mitigated through the system of free allocation and monetary compensation of indirect costs
- The use of free allocation is facing pressure from multiple fronts:
  - It mutes the carbon price signal going through the value chain;
  - It has lead to windfall profits due to inflexible rules as well and passing-through of carbon costs;
  - Not being sustainable in the long-run under current rules: at some point in the (near) future, there will not be sufficient free allocation available as the cap continues to go down → application of CSCF
  - Other countries are also undertaking climate action comparability of efforts required (how?)
- ➔ Simultaneous efforts to better target current carbon leakage protection and design alternatives (CBAM)

Design and implementation of alternatives will take time and not happen instantaneous: free allocation is here to stay in the near to mid term?

#### ERCST

# The future of carbon leakage protection: Free allocation $\bar{R}$

Roundtable on Climate Change and Sustainable Transition

#### Changes introduced in the 2018 review:

- Update of the carbon leakage assessment and list;
- Update of the benchmarks based on past improvement rates (+ mid-phase update);
- Free allocation more in line with production changes (>15%)

#### What additional changes, if any, are needed?

- EC Public Consultation:
  - Share of Free Allocation vs. Auctioning;
  - 'revised definition of product benchmarks to incentivize innovation'?;
  - Better target Free Allocation E.g. <u>Court of auditors recommendations (2020)</u>:
    - Take into account sectors' ability to pass through costs?
    - Tiered approach for free allocation based on relative risk of carbon leakage?
- Ex-post correction to ensure free allocation is in line with output changes?

### The future of carbon leakage protection: Indirect costs

#### Different story than free allocation

- Decentralized approach: at Member States' discretion
- Decreasing aid intensity: no/limits overcompensation

#### Phase 4 changes:

- 75% aid intensity for the entire period
  - Additional compensation possible if indirect costs > 1.5% of GVA = effectively a tiered approach  $\frac{s_{o}}{h_{e}}$
- Compensation based on <u>actual output</u>
- Conditionality to meet certain requirement for covered entities

#### What additional changes, if any, need to be introduced?

- Harmonized approach at EU level?
- (Additional) conditionalities to use compensation received for certain purposes?
- Higher/lower aid intensity?

Roundtable on Climate Change and Sustainable Transition

#### Start of P3 situation (5 MS)

- ETS Emissions : 53.6%
- Electricity use by industry: 47%

#### End of P3 situation (14 MS)

- ETS Emissions : 83.9%
- Electricity use by industry: 73.6%

*Source*: ERCST based on Eurostat and EU TL, 2021

**EKLJI** Roundtable on

## Preparing for the review of the EU ETS The plan to decarbonise industry while protecting against the risk of carbon leakage

10 March 2021

Andrei Marcu, ERCST Jean-Yves Caneill, ERCST Domien Vangenechten, ERCST



Roundtable on Climate Change and Sustainable Transition